File No. 2(1) CAC/Enf-II/2015/FSSAI/ Vol- VI Food Safety and Standards Authority of India

(A Statutory Authority established under the Food Safety and Standards Act, 2006)

Enforcement Division

FDA Bhawan, Kotla Road, New Delhi - 110 002

Minutes of the 16th meeting of Central Advisory Committee of the Food Safety and Standards Authority of India

The 16th meeting of Central Advisory Committee (CAC) of Food Safety and Standards Authority of India was held on 3rd February, 2016 at India Habitat Centre, Lodhi Road, New Delhi. The list of participants who attended the meeting is at **Annexure-1**

2. Director (Enforcement) welcomed all the members of CAC and introduced the new CEO, FSSAI. The proceedings commenced as per the agenda.

Agenda 16.1 Disclosure of Interest

The members filled-in and submitted the Disclosure of Interest forms.

Agenda 16.2 Confirmation of Minutes of the 15th CAC Meeting

The minutes of the 15th CAC meeting were approved and adopted.

Agenda 16.3 Action Taken Report

- 3.1 The Action Taken Report on the minutes of the 15th CAC meeting held on 13.10.2015 was duly noted.
- 3.2 Sh. Salim Veljee, Commissioner of Food Safety, Goa stated that although a DO letter has been sent to Railway Board by FSSAI, the issue of transportation of Food products especially milk and milk products, by the railways without proper temperature control mechanism remains unresolved. The issue was taken up with Dr. Amitava Dutta, Additional Commissioner of Food Safety/Executive Director, Indian Railways who stated that the matter falls under the purview of Konkan Railways. It was informed that since Konkan Railways does not come under the jurisdiction of Railway Board, the issue may be separately flagged with Konkan Railways. At the same time, Additional Commissioner (Food Safety), Indian Railways was also requested to take up the issue with Konkan Railways.

of war

- 3.3 In order to resolve the issue and also flag other issues pertaining to Railways, it was decided that a separate meeting would be conducted with Indian Railways.
- 3.4 Further, Shri George Cheriyan, CUTS, commented that many of the States/ UTs had still not updated the details regarding constitution of Steering Committees on their websites as was the actionable point during the last CAC meeting and requested for resolution of the same. The issue was discussed and it was pointed out by Shri Hemant Rao, Pr. Secretary, UP that constitution of Steering Committee was a State matter and thus the same should not be raised as an agenda point in CAC meetings.
- 3.5 Chairperson, FSSAI and CEO, FSSAI encouraged the involvement of consumer organizations and other stakeholders in food safety through Steering Committees in the States/ UTs since it would help in widening and strengthening the reach of FSSAI among the masses and would also help in bringing greater transparency in the system.

Presentation on status and latest updates in Standards & Regulation

- 1. Assistant Director, Regulation delivered a presentation on latest updates in Standards & Regulations, wherein he gave a brief overview about the Regulations and Standards which have been recently notified. The recent updates were noted by the members of CAC.
- 2. CEO, FSSAI apprised that all efforts are being made for timely notification of more standards for various food commodities. He further requested the Commissioners of Food Safety to provide their suggestions on the new regulations to help the Authority to develop FAQs which shall be uploaded on the FSSAI website. CEO, FSSAI requested the Commissioners of Food Safety that these updates may be disseminated to all concerned in their respective jurisdictions.

Agenda 16.4 Review of organizational set-up and staffing for food regulatory system in States/UTs

Director (Enforcement) highlighted the Gap Analysis of FSOs & DOs that was carried out to identify the gaps in the staffing of the regulatory system. CEO, FSSAI reviewed the status w.r.t no. of FSOs and DOs in the States/UTs and stressed that FSOs are most important functionaries of the Food Regulatory system and appointment of adequate FSOs in the States is imperative for effective enforcement machinery. He further requested the Commissioners to expedite the process and push the proposal for creating adequate posts with the respective Finance Departments of the States/UTs. CEO, FSSAI also

considered that the estimated no. of samples taken for the analysis may not be the actual requirement in the States/UTs and thus the estimates should be done by States/UTs to determine gaps in the staffing and take action against rectifying them.

- On the issue of insufficient manpower, Ms. Rajni Sibal, Joint Secretary, DADF, Ministry of Agriculture informed that Milk Commissioners notified under the erstwhile Milk and Milk Products Order, 1992 were trained in all matters related to Milk & Milk Products and could be utilised for surveillance and enforcement in the area of Milk & Milk Products. Commissioner of Food Safety West Bengal supported the suggestion and further stated that the Milk Commissioners may be notified as Designated Officers under the FSS Act, 2006. Commissioner of the States/UTs suggested that licensing system should be kept uniform and under the purview of single Department i.e. FSSAI. Commissioner of Food Safety, Gujarat suggested that separate posts of Joint/Deputy Food Commissioners according to various categories of food like Milk, Meat, etc. may be created and the Milk Commissioners may be notified under these posts.
- 4.3 CEO, FSSAI suggested that the matter regarding assigning enforcement duty to Milk Commissioners pertaining to Milk & Milk Products could be examined and a view can be taken after taking all factors into consideration.

Agenda 16.5

Licensing and Registration of FBOs, Overview of IT Initiatives, Simplification and Review of Licensing Regulations

- 5.1 The Gap Analysis with regard to Licensing & Registration of FBOs was noted and CEO, FSSAI requested the Commissioners to carry out an estimate taking into account the ground realities in individual States/UTs.
- The CITO, FSSAI gave a presentation on overview of IT initiatives and status and latest updates in FLRS. He flagged the issue of adoption of FLRS in the four States/UTs which are yet to go live. During the discussion some of the States raised the issue of net connectivity being a major problem for adoption of FLRS, to which it was suggested by representatives of FLRS that the option of storing the data offline and then making it online may be explored. On the issue of offline data entry and bearing the cost of Data Entry Operators, it was deliberated that an estimate of the cost may be carried out by the States/UTs and accordingly proposals may be floated with State Finance Departments. It was also requested that if the State/UT Governments are unable to meet the cost for offline data entry, they may individually communicate the matter to the Authority.

Minutes of the 16th CAC Meeting held on 03/02/2016

Page 3 of 13

- 5.3 Shri Bejon Mishra of Consumer Online Foundation, flagged the issue that FBOs are unnecessarily asked to submit documents manually when the same are being uploaded electronically in FLRS. It was retorted that since adoption of FLRS in its nascent stage required adjustment by the FBOs and Food Safety Officials both, the process was not immediately made online but a phased approach was adopted. In the current scenario now that most of the States/UTs as well as FBOs have adapted to the new system, acceptance of manual documents has been done away with in most of the States/UTs and the same would be adopted by rest of the States/UTs. It was assured that duplication of documents would be avoided in future.
- 5.4 CITO, FSSAI apprised the Committee about the new initiative by FSSAI to provide tablets and mobile printers for enforcement activities. It was informed by CEO FSSAI that the initiative would be first piloted by distributing 500 such tablets and printers and based on the feedback the scheme would be expanded to include all States/UTs. The Commissioners of Food Safety of States/UTs appreciated the initiative and volunteered for piloting the initiative in respective State. Commissioner of Food Safety, Kerala informed that the state is already in the process of implementing this initiative. CEO, FSSAI requested the Commissioner to forward the details of the same to the Authority.
- 5.5 CITO, FSSAI apprised the Committee about the proposal to create a complaint handling portal to streamline the redressal of complaints being received with a purpose to serve as a single point of communication between FSSAI and States/UTs Food Safety Departments. Shri Sukhwinder Singh, DO Chandigarh explained the complaint handling model in Chandigarh. He informed that they have developed a hotline number 102 wherein the complainant calls 102 and the same is diverted to the FSO on duty and the process of redressal is taken within 30-35 hrs. Other States like Maharashtra, Goa also informed the Committee about similar complaint handling system in their States. CEO, FSSAI applauded the Chandigarh model and other State models and requested these States to share their SOPs with the Headquarter for developing a National Food Complaint Handling Portal.
- 5.6 The issues pertaining to FLRS like reflection of date of ID generation on DO login (raised by DO Chandigarh) and clear specification of Documents for each category of FBO (raised by Jammu & Kashmir) were noted. CEO, FSSAI further informed that since lots of representations are being received regarding amendment in Licensing & Registration Regulations a working group has been constituted to study the issue. Commissioner of Food Safety, Goa informed that a uniform date for renewal would result in piling up of application and thus is not advisable. Most of the States were of the view that the clause for late fee should be retained however the charging of late fee one

to expiry could be reviewed. The Commissioners of Food Safety were requested to analyse the points mentioned in the agenda and provide their comments on the same.

Agenda 16.6 Review of surveillance & enforcement activities by States/UTs

- 6.1 CEO, FSSAI stressed the need for increase in surveillance activities. He emphasized that the new approach is towards guidance and compliance.
- Director (QA) informed the house that the potential of the laboratories is currently being under-utilised and the States/UTs should realise the full potential of these labs. On the point raised by Uttar Pradesh regarding lack of manpower for carrying out surveillance activities, it was informed by CEO, FSSAI that a National Risk Assessment system is being set up and to develop a robust system, intelligence gathering through surveillance activities is imperative. Director (QA) emphasised use of rapid test kits which would be useful in collecting more samples for surveillance purpose.
- 6.3 The test pilot to be carried out in Delhi for Milk & Milk products was elaborated by Director (QA) and the same was noted by the members of CAC. She further informed that an SOP would be prepared for Milk testing and data for milk samples collected from organised as well as unorganised sectors shall be segregated.

Agenda 16.7 Accountability and control of enforcement machinery

- 7.1 CEO, FSSAI emphasised that in the present system there is a gap regarding accountability of the enforcement machinery and thus several cases of undue harassment of FBOs have been brought to notice. He requested the Commissioners of Food Safety to review the points mentioned in the agenda and to come up with a guidance document for the enforcement machinery.
- 7.2 Dr. Parmanand, Joint Commissioner, Haryana was requested to prepare an SOP for the guidance document and the same would be reviewed by a Committee to finalise the same.
- 7.3 CEO, FSSAI also observed that most of the States/UTs remained unrepresented during the meeting and stated that a letter would be written to the Chief Secretaries of the States/UTs regarding the same.
- 7.4 The proposal for a model railway station was also raised and it was decided that the details for the same would be worked out during the meeting to be held with the Railway officials.

Minutes of the 16th CAC Meeting held on 03/02/2016

Page 5 of 13

Agenda 16.8 Strengthening of State/UT Food Laboratories

- B.1 Director (QA) briefed the Committee regarding the current status w.r.t State Laboratories. It was suggested by Sh. Bejon Mishra that educational institutes and Universities can be roped in for strengthening the laboratory network in States/UTs.
- 8.2 CEO, FSSAI unfurled the scheme for providing financial assistance to States/UTs for upgradation of State/UT Laboratories. Elaborating on the scheme he explained that a one time assistance of 60% of the upgradation cost and a recurring cost of 2 years would be borne by FSSAI and the rest 40% would be have to be borne by the States/UTs. The States/UTs may identify one laboratory in their state, two if the state is large, and funds would be released for its upgradation by the end of this year or next year. He requested the Commissioners to develop budget estimate for complete upgradation and to include the 40% cost in their financial budget for the year.
- He also informed the Committee about the proposal to rope in private labs to develop a PPP model which would be then shared with the States/UTs. Dr. Vasireddi, VIMTA Labs pointed out that instrument validation would be an important criterion for NABL accreditation of the labs. States like UP also requested for a consultant for acquiring NABL accreditation. CEO, FSSAI requested Dr. Vasireddi, to submit a proposal for providing technical support to 4-5 labs in different States/UTs for acquiring NABL accreditation. He also requested Dr. Vasireddi to organize a 3 day visit/workshop for state Food Analyst on educating them on the requirements for NABL accreditation.
- 8.4 The representative from Ministry of Food Processing informed the house that guidelines for upgradation of labs are available on the Ministry website and the same could be used as guidance document by the States/UTs.
- 8.5 Director (QA) on the issue of Capacity Building of laboratory personnel informed the Committee that since the exam for Food Analyst has been pending for a long time, the whole process of selection of Food Analyst would be carried out by CFTRI Mysore. She also informed about the proposal of PG Diploma course to be started in due course which would help junior analysts to take up the exam/interview of Food Analyst.

Agenda 16.9 Clarifications on specific issues

9.1 The Action taken against respective issues received from States/UTs was duly noted by Commissioners of Food Safety of States/UTs.

Agenda 16.10

Awareness building and IEC activities

10.1 CEO, FSSAI called attention of the Committee to the awareness building IEC activities of FSSAI which has been a lacking area in the past. He emphasized the need for creating awareness among citizens regarding food safety. He requested the Commissioners of Food Safety to share the IEC activities being carried out in their States/ UTs. The IEC Activities being taken up by the States/UTs are as follows:

Kerala: Commissioner of Food Safety, Kerala informed about the program initiated by them for school children on safe food and healthy eating habits.

Gujarat: Commissioner of Food Safety Gujarat informed about the food awareness program by audio visual exhibition through mobile education vans in the State of Gujarat.

Goa: Commissioner of Food Safety Goa informed about the one day IEC activities for FBOs of various categories like bakery, alcoholic beverages etc.

Chandigarh: An educational program is being conducted in Chandigarh on 11th February, 2016 for Food Vendors in Punjab University. They also have a mobile testing van to demonstrate simple adulteration detection test in food commodities.

Madhya Pradesh: They have identified a street and turned it into model Food Street by providing arrangements of safe water, lightening, dustbin etc.

Mizoram: They have conducted a workshop for FBOs.

Karnataka: They conducted a Food Vendors/ Hawkers education program in Mysore and distributed pamphlets on food safety. A similar program is scheduled to be conducted in Bangalore.

Punjab: They have allocated 8 mobile vans for milk testing in different districts in collaboration with Punjab Dairy Development Board.

10.2 CEO, FSSAI appreciated the efforts and requested all the States to send their work plan/report of all the IEC/ awareness building activities carried out in their States/UTs. He also unfurled another scheme for providing assistance of fifteen lakh to carry out intensive awareness and IEC activities in the States by identifying NGOs. The proposals received from various NGOs are given to respective States and CEO, FSSAI requested the States/UTs to study these proposals and shortlist the most innovative proposal among them or from new proposals. Commissioners of Food Safety may send their detailed recommendations to FSSAI and the funds would be released accordingly.

100

- Other States/UTs were also requested to submit one or more proposals from their States/UTs.
- 10.3 Shri Bejon Mishra proposed that a Pan India Campaign may be undertaken for awareness and advertising slots may also be taken in television under public cause. Ms. Meetu Kapoor briefed about an initiative by CII on Street Foodstudent training project in UP and West Bengal who in turn would adopt streets for maintaining food safety in these streets. CEO, FSSAI proposed an idea of geographical training of FBOs.

Agenda 16.11 Legal issues of States/UTs

- 11.1 Issuance of Improvement notices for reducing litigations was duly noted by the States/UTs.
- 11.2 On the issue of litigations wherein Ministry and FSSAI are respondents, Shri Hemant Rao informed that except policy decisions litigations, the responsibility of all other litigations were often with the State Food Safety Department CEO, FSSAI requested the Ministry of Health representative (Shri A V. Gawai) to take note of the same.

Agenda 16.12

Extension of time for food business operators to obtain licenses/ registration under the Food Safety and Standards (Licensing and Registration of Food Business) Regulations, 2011

- 12.1 CEO, FSSAI mentioned that the extension of time line has been a bone of contention for long. Since the extension date was due again, he requested the Commissioners of Food Safety to give their opinion on the extension. A consensus was raised and the Committee was of the opinion that the timeline for conversion of licenses should not be further extended since it was giving out a wrong message to the FBOs.
- 12.2 The implications resulting from non extension were also discussed and it was assured by the Commissioners of Food Safety that certain unrest could be handled by notifications and awareness among the FBOs prior to the deadline of the extension.
- 12.3 It was discussed that even if the time was extended, it should not be for 6 months but for a shorter duration of 3 months so that the FBOs get a message that this extension is for the last time.

Agenda 16.13

Unauthorized issue of licenses by local bodies

- 13.1 CEO, FSSAI enquired from the Commissioners of Food Safety whether the problem raised by Food Safety Department Delhi regarding issuance of licenses by local bodies was also prevalent in other States/UTs. Most of the States/UTs replied in the negative.
- 13.2 It was decided that the issue of Delhi would be dealt separately.

Agenda 16.14

Any other Agenda with the permission of the Chair

- 14.1 The meeting concluded with a vote of thanks from CEO, FSSAI.
- 14.2 Actionable points arising from the meeting are at Annexure II.

(Rakesh C. Sharma)

Director (Enforcement)

(Pawan Agarwal)

CEO, FSSAI

The following members were present during the 16th CAC Meeting held on 3rd February, 2016 at India Habitat Centre, Lodhi Road, New Delhi:-

Sh. Ashish Bahuguna, Chairperson, FSSAI- Attended the meeting at the request of CEO, FSSAI and Chairman, CAC

A. Members of CAC:-

- Sh. Pawan Agarwal, CEO, FSSAI- Chairman, CAC
 Commissioners of Food Safety from States/UTs:
- 2. Sh. Hemant Rao, Principal Secretary, Dept. Of Food Safety & Drug Administration, Uttar Pradesh
- 3. Dr. H G. Koshia, Commissioner of Food Safety, Gujarat
- 4. Sh. Salim Veljee, Director, Directorate of FDA, Goa
- 5. Smt. Anupama T. V., Commissioner of Food Safety, Kerala
- 6. Sh. Pankaj Agarwal, Commissioner of Food Safety, Madhya Pradesh
- 7. Dr. K. Ropari, Principal Director and Commissioner of Food Safety, Mizoram
- 8. Sh. Hussan Lal, Commissioner of Food Safety, Punjab
- 9. Smt. Godhuli Mukherjee, Commissioner of Food Safety, West Bengal
- 10. Sh. Babaji Charan Das, Commissioner of Food Safety, Odisha Members from various fields (Private Members):
- 11. Dr. S.P Vasireddi, Executive Chairman, VIMTA Labs, Hyderabad
- 12. Sh. George Cheriyan, Director, CUTS International, Jaipur
- 13. Sh. Jasmeet Singh, Head Food, FICCI, Delhi
- 14. Ms. Pinki Aggarwal, Research Associate, FICCI, Delhi Representatives from States/UTs:
- 15. Dr. Avijit Roy, OSD (FS), A&N Islands
- 16. Dr. Parmanand, Joint Commissioner, Haryana
- 17. Sh. Uday S. Vanjari, Joint Commissioner of Food Safety, Maharashtra
- 18. Sh. Ganesh Parlikar, Assistant Commissioner of Food Safety, Maharashtra
- 19. Dr. Ashwani Dewangan, Assistant Commissioner, Chhattisgarh
- 20. Dr. K. Sreenivasa, Joint Director, Karnataka
- 21. Smt. Lotika Khajuria, Controller Drugs & Food, Jammu & Kashmir
- 22. Dr. Naresh Kimav, State Nodal Officer, Punjab
- 23. Sh. Sukhwinder Singh, DO, Chandigarh
- 24. Sh. Suniti Kumar Gupta, DO, Delhi
- 25. Sh. L D. Thakur, DO, Himachal Pradesh

- 26. Sh. K.S. Rawat, DO, Uttarakhand
- 27. Sh. R K. Singh, OSD, Food Safety, Bihar
- 28. Sh. Pramod Kumar Shukla, Joint Controller, Madhya Pradesh
- 29. Dr. Cleungchau Seami, State Program Officer, Mizoram
- 30. Sh. Sunilkumar Singh, Food Safety Officer, Manipur
- B. Invitees from Ministries/ Departments:-
- 31. Smt. Rajni Sibal, Joint Secretary, DADF, Ministry of Agriculture
- 32. Dr. Amitava Dutta, Additional Commissioner of Food Safety, Executive Director (Health), Ministry of Railways.
- 33. Sh. Ashish V. Gavai, Deputy Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
- 34. Dr. J H. Panwal, Joint Technical Advisor, Ministry of Woman & Child Development
- 35. Sh. K B. Subramanian, Deputy Secretary, Ministry of Food Processing Industries
- 36. Dr. B G. Pandian, Ministry of Food Processing Industries
- 37. Dr. Subhash Gupta, Joint Commissioner, Department of Food and Public Distribution
- 38. Sh. S. K. Pandey, Assistant Director, Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises
- C. Special Invitees:-
- 39. Sh. B. K. Misra, Consumer Online Foundation, Special Invitee
- 40. Ms. Meetu Kapoor, CII, Special Invitee
- 41. Ms. Nirupama, Deputy Secretary, PHD Chambers, Special Invitee
- 42. Sh. D V. Malkar, Executive Secretary, All India Food Processors Association, Special Invitee
- 43. Sh. I.N. Moorthy, Sr. General Manager, NISG, Hyderabad
- 44. Sh. Shridhar D, General Manager, NISG, Hyderabad
- D. FSSAI Officials:-
- 45. Sh. Kumar Anil, Advisor (Standards), FSSAI
- 46. Sh. Sunil Bakshi, Advisor (CODEX), FSSAI
- 47. Sh. Rakesh Chandra Sharma, Director (Enf./GA/Training/Surv.), FSSAI
- 48. Dr. Sandhya Kabra, Director (Legal/QA), FSSAI
- 49. Dr. Rubeena Shaheen, Director (Product Approval), FSSAI
- 50. Sh. Raghavendra Guda, Consultant, FSSAI
- 51. Sh. Tanmoy Prasad, CITO, FSSAI
- 52. Sh. Ajay Tiwari, Deputy Director (QA), FSSAI
- 53. Sh. Ais Kumar, Deputy Director (Training), FSSAI

- 54. Sh. S. Anoop, AD (Enforcement) FSSAI
- 55. Sh. Prabhat Kumar Mishra, AD (Enforcement), FSSAI
- 56. Sh. S. K. Sudhakar, AD (IEC), FSSAI
- 57. Sh. Sunil Kumar Bhadoria, AD (Establishment), FSSAI
- 58. Sh. S. Meena, AD (GA), FSSAI
- * Mistakes in the spelling of any name are unintentional and are regretted.

Action Points emerging from the meeting:

Based on the discussions held during the meeting, the following action points emerged:

A. Action points for States/UTs:-

्री स्1

- 1. States/UTs to furnish estimates to determine gaps in the staffing, licensing and registration of FBOs and take action against rectifying them.
- 2. States of Chandigarh, Maharashtra & Goa to share details/SOPs of complaint handling system.
- 3. States/UTs to furnish comments regarding amendment in Licensing & Registration Regulation as discussed in Agenda no. 16.5.
- 4. Dr. Parmanand, Joint Commissioner, Haryana to prepare an SOP for the guidance document on accountability and control of enforcement machinery and constitution of a Committee for finalizing SOP accountability and control of enforcement machinery.
- 5. States/UTs to develop budget estimate for upgradation of one laboratory in respective State/UT.
- 6. Chandigarh, Kerala, Madhya Pradesh, Karnataka, Punjab, Goa, Gujarat, Mizoram to send work plan/ report of all the IEC/ awareness building activities carried out in their States/UTs.
- 7. States/UTs to send their detailed recommendations on NGOs to be shortlisted for IEC Activities and also to submit one or more proposals from their States/UTs.

B. Action points for FSSAI:-

To conduct a meeting with Indian Railways in order to resolve the issue and also flag other issues pertaining to Indian Railways and Konkan Railways.

C. Action points for NISG:-

NISG to work out feasibility of the option of storing the data offline and then making it online.

D. Action points for VIMTA Labs:-

Dr. Vasireddi, to submit a proposal for providing technical support to 4-5 labs in different States/UTs for acquiring NABL accreditation and also to submit a proposal to organize a 3 day visit/workshop for state Food Analyst on educating them on the requirements for NABL accreditation.

